

LOS ANGELES COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT



DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS
(E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
2018-14-A

JIM McDONNELL
SHERIFF

November 2, 2018

LOS ANGELES COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT
Audit and Accountability Bureau

DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A
AUDIT REPORT

PURPOSE

The Audit and Accountability Bureau (AAB) conducted the Department Electronic Communications (e-mail) Audit, Professional Standards and Training Division under the authority of the Sheriff of Los Angeles County.¹ The audit was performed to determine how employees of the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department (Department) complied with the Manual of Policy and Procedures (MPP) as they pertain to e-mail² and the Policy of Equality.³

The AAB conducted this audit under the guidance of Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards.⁴ The AAB determined that the evidence obtained was sufficient and appropriate to provide a reasonable basis for the findings and conclusions based on the audit objectives.

BACKGROUND

On May 1, 2016, the Sheriff of Los Angeles County responded to media reports that a Department executive used a government e-mail account in an inappropriate manner. In a public service announcement using social media, the Sheriff discussed inappropriate and unprofessional e-mail communications, as they relate to the Department's efforts to fortify public trust and enhance internal and external accountability and transparency.⁵ In doing so, the Sheriff announced his intention to implement a system of random audits of Department e-mails, and expressed that his executive staff would be included. The AAB performed an audit of Department e-mail correspondences to determine if employees utilized e-mail in accordance with the Department's policies, procedures, organizational missions, and Core Values, as well as to ensure supervisory oversight.

¹ The Professional Standards and Training Division is comprised of the personnel assigned to Advocacy Unit, Internal Affairs Bureau, Internal Criminal Investigations Bureau, Risk Management Bureau, and Training Bureau.

² MPP §3-07/210.10, System Use, December 2013, provides the complete definition and requirements of the Department's e-mail policies.

³ MPP §3-01/121.00 through 3-01/122.25, provides the complete definition and requirements of the Department's Policy of Equality. This policy is intended to protect the rights of employees to be free from discrimination, harassment, and retaliation.

⁴ United States Government Accountability Office – By the Comptroller General of the United States, December 2011, Government Auditing Standards 2011 Revision.

⁵ E-mails are electronic communications sent, received, drafted, stored and deleted, including any and all attachments.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

PRIOR AUDITS

There were five prior Department E-mail Audits conducted by the AAB. The first Department E-mail Audit (Project No. 2017-10-A) examining the Executive Offices was concluded and published on August 10, 2017. The first audit resulted in the following recommendation:

The Department policies regarding electronic communications and the Policy of Equality are comprehensive and address risk related to both topics. The prevalence of electronic communications inherently links potential violations of the Policy of Equality to misuse of the Department's e-mail policy. Therefore, it is recommended that policy be amended to cross-reference the related policies where applicable.

Status:

The recommendation has been implemented by the Department.

The second Department E-mail Audit (Project No. 2017-11-A) examining the Special Operations Division was concluded and published on October 26, 2017. The second audit resulted in the following recommendation:

The Department policies including the Policy of Equality are comprehensive in addressing the supervisors and managers duty to report potential violations. However, the expected actions by any Department employee in receipt of an inappropriate e-mail, is not clearly defined. Therefore, it is recommended that policy clearly define the actions required by an employee receiving an inappropriate e-mail generated from a non-Department source.

Status:

The recommendation was reviewed by Department management who concluded existing Department policy sufficiently addressed what is required of an employee when receiving an inappropriate e-mail generated from a non-Department source. Therefore, the recommendation was not implemented.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

The third Department E-mail Audit (Project No. 2017-15-A) examining the North Patrol Division was concluded and published on December 28, 2017. The third audit resulted in the following recommendation:

All Department members are required to conduct themselves in accordance with the Policy of Equality. By reviewing this policy, personnel will remain versed on its contents and requirements with respect to electronic communication. Therefore, it is recommended that personnel continue to be briefed on the Policy of Equality.

Status:

The recommendation has been implemented by the Department.

The fourth Department E-mail Audit (Project No. 2018-1-A) examining the Technology and Support Division was concluded and published on May 2, 2018. The fourth audit resulted in the following recommendation:

All Department members are required to conduct themselves in accordance with the MPP Section 3-07/210.10, System Use. Therefore, it is recommended that personnel continue to be briefed on this policy to ensure they are knowledgeable on Department requirements with respect to electronic communication.

Status:

The recommendation has been implemented by the Department.

The fifth Department E-mail Audit (Project No. 2018-8-A) examining the Countywide Services Division was concluded and published on August 1, 2018. There were no recommendations made for this audit.

METHODOLOGY

Scope

This audit encompassed one objective:

- E-mail System⁶ Use – To determine if Department members' e-mails are consistent with Department policies and procedures.

⁶ The e-mail system is the Department's e-mail program utilizing Microsoft Outlook.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

Auditors reviewed the Department's MPP in the analysis of this audit. The Data Systems Bureau (DSB) manages the Department's Information Technology systems, including overall access and administration of electronic data communications on the Sheriff's Data Network (SDN). Auditors utilized Electronic Discovery (eDiscovery) to retrieve the e-mails which are stored in secure Personal Storage Table folders.⁷ The files retrieved were then examined by auditors to determine compliance with the Department's policies.

Audit Time Period

The time period for this audit was from August 1, 2018, through August 31, 2018. Auditors examined three randomly selected 24-hour periods.⁸

Audit Population

Auditors identified the population utilizing the Enterprise Human Resources System (eHR).⁹ A total of 431 personnel assigned to the Professional Standards and Training Division were identified for the audit time period. The 431 personnel were distinguished into the following groupings: nine executives and management personnel, 255 full-time sworn personnel, 69 uniformed non-sworn personnel and 98 professional staff members. The executives included a Division Chief and three Commanders. The management personnel included four Captains and a Director.

All nine executives and management personnel assigned to the Professional Standards and Training Division were selected. A stratified sampling was applied to the remaining groupings, rendering the following samples: 70 full-time sworn, 41 uniformed non-sworn and 49 professional staff.¹⁰ A total of 169 personnel were audited.

SUMMARY OF AUDIT FINDINGS

The Division did not meet the standard in the area of policy compliance. The results of the audit are summarized in Table No. 1 on the following page.

⁷ The eDiscovery is an electronic data retrieval component of the SDN, accessible on the Department's Intranet, which allows the retrieval of email.

⁸ The DSB provided AAB with access to eDiscovery for the retrieval of emails. The AAB expanded the evaluation by selecting multiple 24-hour periods to capture a greater population for review.

⁹ The eHR is a countywide system which supports the human resources and payroll management functions. The system maintains detailed employee records with the capability to provide reports detailing the employees by unit of assignment.

¹⁰ Using a statistical one-tail test with a 95% confidence level and a 4% error rate, statistically valid samples were identified.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
 PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
 Project No. 2018-14-A**

Table No. 1: Summary of Audit Findings

| Objective No. | Objective | Met the Standard |
|---------------|--|------------------|
| 1 | E-MAIL SYSTEM USE | |
| 1 | <i>Determine if the e-mails complied with the Department's Policy.</i> | 99% |

Objective No. 1 – E-mail System Use

Criteria

Manual of Policy and Procedures, Section 3-07/210.10, System Use, (December 2013), partially states:

Authorized persons are expected to use electronic communications and network systems with a high degree of professional and personal courtesy. Authorized persons must ensure that the tone and content of electronic communications are business-like and exclude inflammatory remarks or inappropriate language. If it is an issue that could cause embarrassment, it does not belong on e-mail.

Manual of Policy and Procedures, Section 3-01/121.40, Policy of Equality - Examples of Conduct that may violate this Policy and Scope of Coverage, (December 2013), partially states:

SCOPE OF COVERAGE

Location: This Policy prohibits discrimination, harassment, retaliation, and inappropriate conduct toward others in the workplace or in other work-related settings . . .

Communication System/Equipment: This Policy also applies to the use of any Departmental communication system or equipment, including but not limited to, electronic mail, internet, intranet, JDIC, telephone lines, computers, facsimile machines, voice mail, radio, and mobile digital terminals. Employees will be disciplined in accordance with this Policy for using any Departmental communication system or equipment to deliver, display, store, publish, circulate, or solicit material in violation of this Policy.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

To facilitate measuring e-mail compliance with the listed MPP sections, the Office of the Undersheriff provided AAB with a list of 124 derogatory terms.¹¹

Audit Procedures

Upon retrieval of the e-mails, auditors performed a search to locate terms from the predetermined list in the title, narrative, and attachments of the e-mails. E-mails were further examined for content to determine if the identified terms were used in a manner which constituted a potential violation of the MPP by inappropriate language in the workplace or workplace settings.

In addition, auditors reviewed e-mails with attachments that were sent and forwarded by Department personnel to determine if the attachments contained terms or images which would constitute a violation of policy. Due to attorney-client privilege, the e-mails addressed to or from the Office of the Los Angeles County Counsel were excluded in the retrieval of e-mail files. Personnel assigned to Professional Standards and Training Division are inherently involved in civil court cases currently being litigated by the Department. Therefore, on October 4, 2018, County Counsel provided auditors with an updated list of attorney e-mail addresses for exclusion.

Supervisors and managers, including the management at AAB, have an affirmative duty to report potential violations of the Policy of Equality. Upon auditors discovering a potential violation of Department policies and procedures, they immediately notified the team lieutenant who reported the violation to the Intake Specialist Unit¹² and completed a Policy of Equality Report Form (POE Report Form).¹³ The original POE Report Form was forwarded to the Intake Specialist Unit.

Findings

One hundred sixty seven of the 169 (99%) personnel examined met the standard for this objective. Auditors discovered two personnel had sent e-mails which contained inappropriate language and derogatory terms. A POE Report Form was completed and sent to the Intake Specialist Unit for one of the findings. The second finding violated the System Use Policy, but did not rise to the level of a Policy of Equality violation. This

¹¹ The list previously provided to AAB by the Office of the Undersheriff was updated by the subject matter expert taking into account the Policy of Equality. Two words, which were identified by the subject matter expert as being used in a derogatory manner, were included in the list. The list is not all-inclusive and does not include benign terms which could be used in a derogatory context.

¹² The Intake Specialist Unit is responsible for receiving employees' complaints of violations of the Policy of Equality. Its primary role is to initially evaluate the substance of equity-based complaints and determine the proper path for the investigation and/or disposition of those complaints.

¹³ The POE Report Form (POE-001) is used to report a potential violation of the Policy of Equality to the Intake Specialist Unit.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

violation, reported by AAB, was documented by the Intake Specialist Unit who provided a reference number for an Ombudsperson Log Entry.¹⁴

CONCLUSION

During the course of the audit, auditors assessed the compliance with policies and procedures as it pertains to the use of electronic communications, the Policy of Equality, and supervisory responsibilities. At the direction of the Sheriff, AAB will continue to conduct random e-mail audits.

RECOMMENDATION

The resulting recommendation coincides with the findings and conclusion from the objective of this audit. It is intended to provide Department management with a tool to correct deficiencies and improve performance.

1. All Department members are required to conduct themselves in accordance with the MPP Section 3-07/210.10, System Use. Therefore, it is recommended that personnel continue to be briefed on this policy to ensure they are knowledgeable on Department requirements with respect to electronic communication.
(Objective No. 1)

VIEWS OF RESPONSIBLE OFFICIALS

On November 2, 2018, the Office of the Undersheriff, submitted a formal response to AAB expressing general concurrence with the results of this audit. A copy of the audit report was provided to the Office of Inspector General.

This space intentionally left blank

¹⁴ The Office of the Ombudsperson functions as a specialized resource for all Department members concerning the Policy of Equality and associated procedures. The Ombudsperson Unit responds to all inquiries, concerning the Policy of Equality and provides information to Department members about their rights, responsibilities, complaint, and investigation procedures. Subsequently, the Ombudsperson Unit will generate a corresponding Ombudsperson Log number to record the incident.

**DEPARTMENT ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS (E-MAIL) AUDIT
PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS AND TRAINING DIVISION
Project No. 2018-14-A**

This audit was submitted on this 2nd day of November, 2018, by the Audit and Accountability Bureau.

Original signature on file at AAB

CELESTE E. MARIANO
Project Manager
Law Enforcement Auditor
Audit and Accountability Bureau
Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department

Original signature on file at AAB

RHEA BARAWID
Assistant Project Manager
Law Enforcement Auditor
Audit and Accountability Bureau
Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department

Original signature on file at AAB

BRIAN A. MEEDER
Lieutenant
Audit and Accountability Bureau
Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department

Original signature on file at AAB

FAYE A. ADRAGNA
Captain
Audit and Accountability Bureau
Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department